

# On operator valued R-diagonal and Haar unitary elements

Ken Dykema (with John Griffin)

Texas A&M University

February 20, 2024

Zooming in to UC-Berkeley

Probabilistic Operator Algebra Seminar

# Haar unitary and R-diagonal elements

We work in a tracial von Neumann algebra  $(\mathcal{M}, \tau)$ . Namely,  $\mathcal{M}$  is a von Neumann algebra and  $\tau$  is a normal, faithful, tracial state on  $\mathcal{M}$ .

Note: some results described in this talk have non-tracial versions, but for simplicity we assume we are in the tracial setting.

A *Haar unitary element* is a unitary  $u \in \mathcal{M}$  so that  $\tau(u^n) = 0$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z} \setminus \{0\}$ . This entails that  $\tau$  of spectral measure of  $u$  is Haar measure on the unit circle.

A *circular element* is  $z \in \mathcal{M}$  where  $\operatorname{Re} z$  and  $\operatorname{Im} z$  are free, centered semicircular elements with the same second moment.

## Theorem [Voiculescu '90]

If  $z$  is a circular element, then it has polar decomposition  $z = u|z|$ , where  $u$  is a Haar unitary and  $u$  and  $|z|$  are  $*$ -free from each other.

*Free cumulants* of a family of elements in  $\mathcal{M}$  were introduced by [Speicher '94].

[Nica, Speicher, '97] defined  $a \in \mathcal{M}$  to be *R-diagonal* if all the cumulants of the pair  $(a, a^*)$  vanish except for those corresponding to alternating patterns  $(a, a^*, \dots, a, a^*)$  and  $(a^*, a, \dots, a^*, a)$  of even length.

## Proposition [Nica, Shlyakhtenko, Speicher '01]

An element  $a \in \mathcal{M}$  is R-diagonal if and only if  $a$  has the same  $*$ -distribution as  $uh$  (in some tracial von Neumann algebra), where  $u$  is a Haar unitary,  $h \geq 0$  and where  $u$  and  $h$  are  $*$ -free.

In particular, Haar unitary elements and circular elements are R-diagonal.

# R-diagonality (alternative formulation)

## Definition [Boedihardjo, D., '18]

Given  $\epsilon = (\epsilon(1), \dots, \epsilon(n)) \in \{1, *\}^n$ , the *maximal alternating interval partition*  $\sigma(\epsilon)$  of  $\epsilon$  is the partition into the largest possible interval blocks such that each block is alternating.

$$\text{E.g., } \epsilon = (\underbrace{*, 1, *}, \underbrace{*, 1}, \underbrace{1, *}) \implies \sigma(\epsilon) = \{\{1, 2, 3\}, \{4, 5\}, \{6, 7\}\}.$$

## Prop. (equivalent, mild reformulation of part of [NiShISp '01])

$a \in \mathcal{M}$  is R-diagonal if and only if

(a) all odd alternating moments vanish

(b)  $\forall n \forall \epsilon \in \{1, *\}^n$ ,

$$\phi \left( \prod_{V \in \sigma(\epsilon)} \left( \left( \prod_{j \in V} a^{\epsilon(j)} \right) - \phi \left( \prod_{j \in V} a^{\epsilon(j)} \right) \right) \right) = 0.$$

## $B$ -valued noncommutative probability spaces

Let  $(B, \tau_B)$  be a tracial von Neumann algebra. We work in a tracial,  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$ ; this means  $\mathcal{A}$  is a von Neumann algebra containing  $B$  as a unital subalgebra and  $\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow B$  is a normal, faithful conditional expectation such that  $\tau = \tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}$  is a trace on  $\mathcal{A}$ .

## $B$ -valued $*$ -moments

The  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments of  $a \in \mathcal{A}$  are the multilinear maps  $B \times \cdots \times B \rightarrow B$  of the form

$$(b_1, \dots, b_{n-1}) \mapsto \mathcal{E}(a^{\epsilon(1)} b_1 a^{\epsilon(2)} b_2 \cdots a^{\epsilon(n-1)} b_{n-1} a^{\epsilon(n)})$$

for  $n \in \mathbf{N}$  and  $\epsilon = (\epsilon(1), \dots, \epsilon(n)) \in \{1, *\}^n$ .

$B$ -valued free cumulants were defined by [Speicher '98].

$B$ -valued R-diagonal elements were defined [Śniady, Speicher '01] in terms of  $B$ -valued cumulants.

## Theorem [Śniady, Speicher '01]

An element  $a \in \mathcal{A}$  is  $B$ -valued R-diagonal if and only if there exists an enlargement  $(\tilde{A}, \tilde{\mathcal{E}})$  of  $(A, \mathcal{E})$  and a unitary  $u \in \tilde{A}$  such that

- $u$  commutes with  $B$ ,
- $\{u, u^*\}$  is free from  $\{a, a^*\}$  (over  $B$ ),
- $\tilde{\mathcal{E}}(u^k) = 0$  for all  $k \in \mathbb{Z} \setminus \{0\}$ ,
- $a$  and  $ua$  have the same  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments.

## Operator-valued R-diagonal elements (2)

### Corollary

If  $a$  is a  $B$ -valued R-diagonal element with polar decomposition  $a = v|a|$ , then the partial isometry  $v$  is also  $B$ -valued R-diagonal.

Proof: The  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments of  $v$  are determined by those of  $a$ . But with  $u$  as in the previous theorem,  $a$  and  $ua$  have the same  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments. The polar decomposition of  $ua$  is  $uv$ , so  $v$  and  $uv$  have the same  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments.

### Corollary

If  $a$  is a  $B$ -valued R-diagonal and if  $d$  is  $*$ -free from  $a$  (over  $B$ ), then  $ad$  is  $B$ -valued R-diagonal.

Proof: Let  $u$  be a Haar unitary commuting with  $B$  and  $*$ -free from  $\{a, d\}$ . Then  $ua$  has the same  $*$ -moments as  $a$ , and  $ua$  is  $*$ -free from  $d$ , so  $uad$  has the same  $*$ -moments as  $ad$ .

# Operator-valued R-diagonal elements (3)

## Reformulation [Boedihardjo, D. '18]

An element  $a \in A$  is R-diagonal if and only if

- (a) all alternating moments of odd length vanish, for example those of the form

$$\mathcal{E}(ab_1a^*b_2ab_3a^*b_4a),$$

- (b)  $\forall n \forall \epsilon \in \{1, *\}^n, \forall b_1, \dots, b_n \in B,$

$$\mathcal{E} \left( \prod_{V \in \sigma(\epsilon)} \left( \left( \prod_{j \in V} a^{\epsilon(j)} b_j \right) - \mathcal{E} \left( \prod_{j \in V} a^{\epsilon(j)} b_j \right) \right) \right) = 0,$$

where  $\sigma(\epsilon)$  is the maximal alternating interval partition associated to  $\epsilon$ .

In particular, all  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments of an R-diagonal element  $a$  are determined by the alternating  $B$ -valued  $*$ -moments.



## Operator-valued R-diagonal elements (4)

Thus, the  $*$ -moments of an R-diagonal element  $a$  are determined by the  $*$ -moments having the even, alternating  $*$ -moments, denoted

$$\alpha_n(b_1, \dots, b_{2n-1}) := \mathcal{E}(a^* b_1 a b_2 a^* b_3 a \cdots b_{2n-2} a^* b_{2n-1} a)$$

$$\beta_n(b_1, \dots, b_{2n-1}) := \mathcal{E}(a b_1 a^* b_2 a b_3 a^* \cdots a^* b_{2n-2} a b_{2n-1} a^*).$$

## $B$ -valued circular elements ([Śniady '03] ?)

A  $B$  valued circular element is an  $R$ -diagonal element  $z$  whose  $B$ -valued cumulants vanish except for those of second order. In practice, these are the completely positive maps  $B \rightarrow B$

$$\alpha_1(b) = \mathcal{E}(z^*bz), \quad \beta_1(b) = \mathcal{E}(zbz^*),$$

and then the higher even, alternating moments are determined recursively (via the moment-cumulant formula) for  $n \geq 2$  by

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_n(b_1, \dots, b_{n-1}) &= \mathcal{E}(a^*b_1ab_2a^*b_3a \cdots b_{2n-2}a^*b_{2n-1}a) \\ &= \alpha_1(b_1)b_2\alpha_{n-1}(b_3, \dots, b_{2n-1}) \\ &\quad + \sum_{k=2}^{n-1} \alpha_1(b_1\beta_{k-1}(b_2, \dots, b_{2k-2})b_{2k-1})b_{2k} \\ &\quad \quad \quad \alpha_{n-k}(b_{2k+1}, \dots, b_{2n-1}) \\ &\quad + \alpha_1(b_1\beta_{n-1}(b_2, \dots, b_{2n-1})b_{2n-1}) \end{aligned}$$

and likewise, reversing the roles of  $\beta$  and  $\alpha$ .

## $B$ -valued circular elements (2)

Given any two completely positive maps  $\alpha_1$  and  $\beta_1$  from  $B$  to  $B$ , there exists a unique corresponding  $B$ -valued circular element  $z$  such that

$$\alpha_1(b) = \mathcal{E}(z^*bz), \quad \beta_1(b) = \mathcal{E}(zbz^*).$$

### Proposition [Boedihardjo, D. '18]

The  $B$ -valued circular element  $z$  can be realized in a tracial  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space if and only if for a faithful tracial state  $\tau_B$  on  $B$ , we have

$$\tau_B(\alpha_1(b_1)b_2) = \tau_B(b_1\beta_1(b_2))$$

for all  $b_1, b_2 \in B$ .

## Example [Boedihardjo, D. '18]

Take  $B = \mathbb{C}^2$  endowed with the equal weight trace and consider the completely positive maps  $B \rightarrow B$

$$\alpha_1(\lambda_1, \lambda_2) = \left( \frac{\lambda_1}{2}, \frac{\lambda_1}{2} + \lambda_2 \right)$$
$$\beta_1(\lambda_1, \lambda_2) = \left( \frac{\lambda_1 + \lambda_2}{2}, \lambda_2 \right).$$

Let  $z$  be the corresponding (tracial) circular element. We compute the distribution of  $z^*z$  with respect to  $\tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}$  and see that it has zero kernel, so it has polar decomposition  $z = u|z|$ , with  $u$  unitary.

We cannot have that  $u$  and  $|z|$  are  $*$ -free over  $B$ , because  $\beta_1(1) = 1$  while  $\alpha_1(1) \neq 1$ .

### Conclusion

In the  $B$ -valued setting, circular elements and (more generally)  $R$ -diagonal elements need not have free polar decompositions.

# Classes of $B$ -valued Haar unitaries

We work in  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$  as before.

## Definition

Let  $u \in \mathcal{A}$  be a unitary element. We say  $u$  is

- (a) a *Haar unitary element* if  $\mathcal{E}(u^n) = 0$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z} \setminus \{0\}$ ,
- (b) a *balanced unitary element* if  $\mathcal{E}(u^{\epsilon(1)}b_1u^{\epsilon(2)}b_2 \cdots u^{\epsilon(n-1)}b_{n-1}u^{\epsilon(n)}) = 0$  whenever  $\#\{j \mid \epsilon(j) = *\} \neq \#\{j \mid \epsilon(j) = 1\}$  and  $b_1, \dots, b_{n-1} \in B$ ,
- (c) an *R-diagonal unitary element* if  $u$  is also R-diagonal,
- (d) a *normalizing Haar unitary element* if  $u$  is Haar unitary and if, for some automorphism  $\theta$  of  $B$  and all  $b$  in  $B$ ,  $u^*bu = \theta(b)$ .

## Theorem

(d)  $\implies$  (c)  $\implies$  (b)  $\implies$  (a), and none of the reverse implications hold.

## Example: a Haar unitary that is not balanced

Let  $\tau$  be the trace on  $C(\mathbb{T})$  given by integration with respect to Haar measure on the unit circle  $\mathbb{T}$ . Let  $v \in C(\mathbb{T})$  be the identity map on  $\mathbb{T}$  (thus, a Haar unitary with respect to  $\tau$ ). Let  $\mathcal{A} = M_2(C(\mathbb{T})) \cong M_2(\mathbb{C}) \otimes C(\mathbb{T})$  and let  $B \subseteq \mathcal{A}$  be the diagonal matrices having scalar entries, so  $B \cong \mathbb{C}^2$ . Let  $\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow B$  be

$$\mathcal{E} \left( \begin{pmatrix} f_{11} & f_{12} \\ f_{21} & f_{22} \end{pmatrix} \right) = \begin{pmatrix} \tau(f_{11}) & 0 \\ 0 & \tau(f_{22}) \end{pmatrix}.$$

Let  $p = \frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$  and let  $u = p \otimes v + (1 - p) \otimes v^*$ . Then  $u$  is Haar unitary with respect to  $\mathcal{E}$ , but  $\mathcal{E}(ue_{11}u) = \frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & -1 \end{pmatrix}$ , so  $u$  is not a balanced unitary.

## Example: a balanced unitary that is not R-diagonal

Let  $\tau$  be the canonical trace on  $C^*(\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z})$ , with  $v, w \in C^*(\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z})$  commuting Haar unitaries. Let

$\mathcal{A} = M_2(C^*(\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z})) \cong M_2(\mathbb{C}) \otimes C^*(\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z})$  and let  $B \subseteq \mathcal{A}$  be the diagonal matrices having scalar entries, so  $B \cong \mathbb{C}^2$ . As before, let  $\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow B$  be

$$\mathcal{E} \left( \begin{pmatrix} f_{11} & f_{12} \\ f_{21} & f_{22} \end{pmatrix} \right) = \begin{pmatrix} \tau(f_{11}) & 0 \\ 0 & \tau(f_{22}) \end{pmatrix}.$$

and  $p = \frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$ . Let  $u = p \otimes v + (1 - p) \otimes w$ . Then it is straightforward to compute that  $u$  is a balanced unitary, but when  $b_1 = b_2 = b_3 = 1 \oplus 0 \in B$  (identified with the matrix unit  $e_{11} \in M_2(\mathbb{C})$ ), we find

$$E((u^* b_1 u - E(u^* b_1 u)) b_2 (u b_3 u^* - E(u b_3 u^*))) = \frac{1}{8} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & -1 \end{pmatrix} \neq 0.$$

Thus,  $u$  is not an R-diagonal element.

## Example: an R-diagonal unitary that is not normalizing

Let  $B = \mathbb{C}^2$  and let  $z$  be the  $B$ -valued circular element corresponding to the maps

$$\alpha_1(\lambda_1, \lambda_2) = \left( \frac{\lambda_1}{2}, \frac{\lambda_1}{2} + \lambda_2 \right)$$
$$\beta_1(\lambda_1, \lambda_2) = \left( \frac{\lambda_1 + \lambda_2}{2}, \lambda_2 \right).$$

We know that  $z$  has polar decomposition  $z = u|z|$ , with  $u$  unitary. By the Corollary to [Śniady, Speicher '01], this  $u$  is an R-diagonal unitary element.



## Example: an R-diagonal unitary that is not normalizing (2)

However, if  $u$  were normalizing with  $u^*bu = \theta(b)$ , then we would have, for every  $x \in \mathcal{A}$ ,  $\mathcal{E}(x) = 0 \implies \mathcal{E}(uxu^*) = 0$ , since

$$\begin{aligned}\tau_B(\mathcal{E}(uxu^*)^* \mathcal{E}(uxu^*)) &= \tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}(ux^*u^* \mathcal{E}(uxu^*)) = \tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}(x^*u^* \mathcal{E}(uxu^*)u) \\ &= \tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}(x^* \theta(\mathcal{E}(uxu^*))) = \tau_B(\mathcal{E}(x^*) \theta(\mathcal{E}(uxu^*))) = 0.\end{aligned}$$

This implies, for all  $x \in \mathcal{A}$ ,  $\mathcal{E}(uxu^*) = \theta^{-1}(\mathcal{E}(x))$ .

Now we get

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{E}(zz^*bzz^*) &= \mathcal{E}(u|z|^2u^*bu|z|^2u^*) = \theta^{-1}(\mathcal{E}(|z|^2\theta(b)|z|^2)) \\ &= \theta^{-1}(\mathcal{E}(z^*z\theta(b)z^*z)).\end{aligned}$$

However,  $\mathcal{E}(zz^*bzz^*)$  and  $\mathcal{E}(z^*z\theta(b)z^*z)$  can be computed in terms of the defining completely positive maps  $\alpha_1$  and  $\beta_1$ , and we easily see that the above equality fails to hold (for both possible automorphisms  $\theta$ ) when  $b = (1, 0) \in B$ .

# Motivating Question: what can $B$ -valued R-diagonal unitaries look like if they are not normalizing?

One example: we understand the  $\mathbb{C}^2$ -valued circular element  $z$  of the previous example quite well and we know  $z = u|z|$ , where  $u$  is an R-diagonal unitary that is not normalizing (and also not free from  $|z|$ ).

We know the distribution of  $|z|^2$  with respect to  $\tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}$ . Can we use this to find the  $\mathbb{C}^2$ -valued distribution of  $|z|$  and thereby to describe the  $\mathbb{C}^2$ -valued distribution of  $u$ ?

Another idea: suppose there exists a  $B$ -valued circular element  $z$ , and suppose  $z = u|z|$  with  $u$  and  $|z|$   $*$ -free over  $B$ . Let us call this a *free polar decomposition*. Perhaps freeness would help us to find out more about the  $*$ -moments of  $u$  from those of  $z$ . Of course, if  $u$  is already normalizing (of  $B$ ), then we are not so interested in this case.

# Bipolar decompositions

Unfortunately, we don't understand well, in terms of cumulants, conditions for a polar decomposition of a  $B$ -valued  $\mathbb{R}$ -diagonal to have a free and normalizing unitary part. (There is a theorem in [Boedihardjo, Dykema '18] that purports to do so, but it is erroneous. See [erratum '23].) Instead, we turn to bipolar decompositions.

## Definition

Let  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$  be a  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space and let  $a \in \mathcal{A}$ . A *bipolar decomposition* of  $a$  is a pair  $(u, x)$  of elements in some  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space  $(\mathcal{A}', \mathcal{E}')$ , such that  $u$  is a partial isometry,  $x$  is self-adjoint and  $ux$  has the same  $*$ -moments as  $a$ .

Bipolar decompositions are not unique. Examples include polar decompositions. “Bipolar” refers to the positive and negative directions of  $\mathbb{R}$ . If  $(u, x)$  is a bipolar decomposition, then  $x = s|x|$  for a symmetry (namely, a self-adjoint unitary)  $s$  that commutes with  $x$ . Thus,  $(us)|x|$  is a polar decomposition.

# Bipolar decompositions (2)

## Definition

A bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  in  $(\mathcal{A}', \mathcal{E}')$  of an element  $a$  is

- *minimal* if  $u^*u$  equals the support projection of  $x$ ;
- *unitary* if  $u$  is a unitary element;
- *tracial* if there is a normal tracial state  $\tau_B$  on  $B$  so that  $\tau_B \circ \mathcal{E}'$  is a trace on the  $*$ -algebra generated by  $u$  and  $x$ ;
- *standard* if there is a symmetry  $s \in \mathcal{A}'$  such that  $x = s|x|$  and such that  $s$  commutes with  $x$ , with  $u$  and with every  $b \in B$ ;
- *even* if all odd moments of  $x$  vanish, namely, if  $\mathcal{E}'(xb_1xb_2 \cdots xb_{2n}x) = 0$  for all  $n \geq 1$  and  $b_1, \dots, b_{2n} \in B$ .
- *free* if  $u$  and  $x$  are  $*$ -free over  $B$  (with respect to the conditional expectation  $\mathcal{E}'$ );
- *normalizing* if it is unitary and  $u$  normalizes the algebra  $B$ , namely, if  $u^*bu = \theta(b)$  for every  $b \in B$ , for some automorphism  $\theta$  of  $B$ .

## Bipolar decompositions (3)

### Lemma

Every  $B$ -valued element,  $a$ , has a bipolar decomposition that is standard, even and minimal. If  $a$  is tracial, then this bipolar decomposition can also be taken to be tracial.

Proof: If  $a = v|a|$  is the polar decomposition, then take  $u = v \oplus (-v)$  and  $x = |a| \oplus (-|a|)$ .

### Lemma on R-diagonal unitaries in bipolar decompositions

Suppose a  $B$ -valued R-diagonal element  $a$  has a bipolar decomposition  $(v, x)$ . Then  $a$  also has a bipolar decomposition  $(v', x')$ , where  $x'$  has the same distribution as  $x$  and where  $v'$  is  $B$ -valued R-diagonal. Furthermore, if  $(v, x)$  is tracial, unitary, minimal, standard, free or normalizing, then also  $(v', x')$  can be taken to be tracial, unitary, minimal, standard, free, or normalizing, respectively.

# Free, normalizing bipolar decompositions of R-diagonals

Recall our notation for the even alternating moments:

$$\alpha_n(b_1, \dots, b_{2n-1}) := \mathcal{E}(a^* b_1 a b_2 a^* b_3 a \cdots b_{2n-2} a^* b_{2n-1} a)$$

$$\beta_n(b_1, \dots, b_{2n-1}) := \mathcal{E}(a b_1 a^* b_2 a b_3 a^* \cdots a^* b_{2n-2} a b_{2n-1} a^*).$$

**Theorem [Boedihardjo, D. '18] (but using current terminology)**

Let  $a$  be a  $B$ -valued R-diagonal element. Then  $a$  has a free, normalizing bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  with corresponding automorphism  $u^* b u = \theta(b)$  if and only if

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_n(b_1, \theta(b_2), b_3, \dots, \theta(b_{2n-2}), b_{2n-1}) \\ = \theta(\beta_n(\theta(b_1), b_2, \theta(b_3), \dots, b_{2n-2}, \theta(b_{2n-1}))) \end{aligned}$$

for all  $n$  and  $b_1, \dots, b_{2n-1} \in B$ .

If  $a$  is actually  $B$ -valued circular, then the above condition becomes  $\alpha_1(b) = \theta(\beta_1(\theta(b)))$  for all  $b \in B$ .

## Example with a free normalizing bipolar decomposition but no normalizing polar decomposition

Let  $z$  be a copy of Voiculescu's circular element ( $\mathbb{C}$ -valued) in a  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space  $(\mathcal{A}_0, \tau_0)$ . Suppose  $(B, \tau_B)$  is a tracial von Neumann algebra,  $B \neq \mathbb{C}$ . Let  $(\mathcal{A}, \tau) = (\mathcal{A}_0, \tau_0) * (B, \tau_B)$  be the free product of von Neumann algebras and let  $\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow B$  be the  $\tau$ -preserving conditional expectation onto  $B$ . By [Śniady, Speicher '01],  $a$  is also  $B$ -valued circular in  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$ , with corresponding completely positive maps  $\alpha_1(b) = \beta_1(b) = \tau_B(b)1$ . By the previous Theorem, for every  $\tau_B$ -preserving automorphism  $\theta$  of  $B$ , there is a free, normalizing bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  of  $a$  with  $u^*bu = \theta(b)$  for all  $b \in B$ . However, the polar decomposition of  $a$  is  $a = v|a|$  with  $v \in \mathcal{A}_0$  that is Haar unitary with respect to  $\tau_0$ . Thus,  $v$  is free from  $B$  and cannot normalize  $B$ .

## More on that example

The previous example can be concretely realized in the free product (over  $\mathbb{C}$ )

$$(\mathcal{A}, \tau) = (B \rtimes_{\theta} \mathbb{Z}, \tau_B \circ E) * (L^{\infty}[-2, 2], \tau_2)$$

where  $E : B \rtimes_{\theta} \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow B$  is the conditional expectation and  $\tau_2$  is by integration against Lebesgue measure. Let  $\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow B$  be the  $\tau$ -preserving conditional expectation.

Now take a semicircular element  $x \in L^{\infty}[-2, 2]$  and a symmetry  $s$  so that  $x = s|x|$ . Let  $u \in B \rtimes_{\theta} \mathbb{Z}$  be the Haar unitary implementing  $\theta$ . Then  $z = us|x|$  is a circular element with respect to  $\tau$ , is  $*$ -free from  $B$ ,  $us$  and  $|x|$  are  $*$ -free from each other and  $(u, x)$  is a free, normalizing bipolar decomposition for  $z$ .



# But under a nondegeneracy condition:

## Theorem

Let  $a$  be a  $B$ -valued random variable in a  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability space  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$  and assume that either of the subspaces

$$\text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((a^*a)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \} \text{ or } \text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((aa^*)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \}$$

is weakly dense in  $B$ . Suppose that  $a$  has free bipolar decompositions  $(u, x)$  and  $(\tilde{u}, \tilde{x})$  in  $B$ -valued  $W^*$ -noncommutative probability spaces  $(A', E')$  and  $(\tilde{A}, \tilde{E})$ , respectively, with  $\tilde{E}$  faithful. Suppose  $u$  and  $\tilde{u}$  are unitaries satisfying  $E'(u) = 0 = \tilde{E}(\tilde{u})$  and suppose that  $u$  normalizes  $B$ . Then  $\tilde{u}$  normalizes  $B$ , and induces the same automorphism, namely,  $\tilde{u}^*b\tilde{u} = u^*bu$  for all  $b \in B$ .

# Motivating question and answer in a special case

## Question

Suppose a tracial  $B$ -valued circular element  $a$  has a tracial, free, bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  with  $u$  unitary. Must  $a$  also have a free bipolar decomposition that is normalizing?

Note that under the nondegeneracy hypothesis, that

$$\text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((a^*a)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \} \text{ or } \text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((aa^*)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \}$$

is weakly dense in  $B$ , we would conclude that every free bipolar decomposition of  $a$  is normalizing.

## Theorem

Yes, when  $B = \mathbb{C}^2$ .

# The theorem covering the case $B = \mathbb{C}^2$

In particular, we prove that if  $a$  is tracial  $\mathbb{C}^2$ -valued circular in  $(\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{E})$  with corresponding completely positive maps  $\alpha_1$  and  $\beta_1$  and if  $a$  has a free bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  with  $u$  unitary, then  $\alpha_1 = \theta \circ \beta_1 \circ \theta$  for one of the two automorphisms  $\theta$  of  $\mathbb{C}^2$ .

Method of proof: arduous calculation.

Just to give a taste of this: the defining maps  $\alpha_1$  and  $\beta_1$ , as well as the trace  $\tau_B$ , are defined in terms of certain parameters. Taking  $a = ux$ , we use the freeness assumption to obtain certain relations, e.g.,

$$\mathcal{E}((aa^*)^n) = \mathcal{E}(u\mathcal{E}(x^{2n})u^*) = \mathcal{E}(u\mathcal{E}((a^*a)^n)u^*)$$

and more complicated ones, e.g., involving  $\mathcal{E}((aa^*)^n(a^*a)^m(aa^*)^k)$ . We can dispense with a degenerate case and assume without loss of generality  $\text{span}\{1_B, \mathcal{E}(a^*a)\} = B$ . Using all of this and more, we obtain some nasty-looking algebraic relations among the aforementioned parameters. With help of Mathematica, we are able to show that we must have  $\alpha_1 = \theta \circ \beta_1 \circ \theta$  for one of the  $\theta$ .

# Open questions:

Assume that

$$\text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((a^*a)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \} \text{ or } \text{span} \{ \mathcal{E}((aa^*)^k) \mid k \geq 0 \}$$

is weakly dense in  $B$ ,

## Question

Suppose a tracial  $B$ -valued circular element  $a$  has a tracial, free, bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$  with  $u$  unitary. Must  $u$  normalize  $B$ ?

## Question

Suppose a tracial  $B$ -valued R-diagonal element  $a$  has a tracial, free, bipolar decomposition  $(u, x)$ . Must its polar decomposition be free?

- [1] D. Voiculescu, *Circular and semicircular systems and free product factors*, Operator algebras, unitary representations, enveloping algebras, and invariant theory (Paris, 1989), Progr. Math., vol. 92, Birkhäuser Boston, 1990, pp. 45–60.
- [2] R. Speicher, *Multiplicative functions on the lattice of noncrossing partitions and free convolution*, Math. Ann. **298** (1994), 611–628.
- [3] A. Nica and R. Speicher, *R-diagonal pairs—a common approach to Haar unitaries and circular elements*, Free Probability Theory (Waterloo, Ontario, 1995), Fields Inst. Commun., vol. 12, Amer. Math. Soc., 1997, pp. 149–188.
- [4] R. Speicher, *Combinatorial Theory of the Free Product with Amalgamation and Operator-Valued Free Probability Theory*, Mem. Amer. Math. Soc., vol. 627, 1998.
- [5] A. Nica, D. Shlyakhtenko, and R. Speicher, *R-diagonal elements and freeness with amalgamation*, Canad. J. Math. **53** (2001), 355–381.
- [6] P. Śniady and R. Speicher, *Continuous family of invariant subspaces for R-diagonal operators*, Invent. Math. **146** (2001), 329–363.
- [7] P. Śniady, *Multinomial identities arising from free probability theory*, J. Combin. Theory Ser. A **101** (2003), 1–19.
- [8] M. Boedihardjo and K. Dykema, *On algebra-valued R-diagonal elements.*, Houston J. Math. **44** (2018), 209–252;: *Erratum* **49** (2023), 157–158.
- [9] K. Dykema and J. A. Griffin, *On operator valued Haar unitaries and bipolar decompositions of R-diagonal elements*, Integral Equations Operator Theory, to appear, available at [arXiv:2306.17333\(w/Mathematica\)](https://arxiv.org/abs/2306.17333).